Challenges and ways forward emerging from the TFD dialoguing initiative on REDD Readiness

James Mayers
Co-leader TFD
## REDD readiness – dream or nightmare?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Money</th>
<th>Dream</th>
<th>Nightmare</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Money at last!</td>
<td>Where’s the money gone?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enough to tip the balance to sustainable forestry and land use in the right hands</td>
<td>Not enough money, it’s wasted, stolen or in the wrong hands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leverage</td>
<td>Attention at last!</td>
<td>More harm than good?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enough to secure rights and build capabilities</td>
<td>Local and national stakeholders disenchanted, disenfranchised and disempowered</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Common challenges identified

Process challenges

1. **Engagement** - meaningful participation of stakeholders
2. **Information** - generation, quality, access and use

Thematic challenges

3. **Cost and benefit management** – finance and benefit distribution mechanisms
4. **Policy and legal reform** – for secure rights and responsibilities
5. **Integration** - of REDD+ into broader development and land-use
ENGAGEMENT - meaningful participation of stakeholders
Challenges

• Uncertainty of scope, scale and rules internationally – affects what is on the table nationally
• Clarity about who, what and why to engage
• Engagement of commonly marginalized groups
• Capacity of groups to effectively engage
• Clarity of government roles in engagement
• Private sector agenda and means of engagement
• Civil society agility to: critique, inform, pilot
... engagement challenges continued

• Key rights and institutional constraints as barriers to engagement

• Formats and prescriptions of international programs yet to mainstream effective multi-stakeholders engagement

• Engagement between local, national, regional levels

• Instruments for focused engagement: negotiation tools, FPIC, conflict management

• Resources for engagement
Ways forward on engagement

1. Integrate stakeholders needs in global negotiation processes
2. Engage economically and politically empowered groups and leaders
3. Multi-stakeholder assessment:
   – Map stakeholders and their willingness and capacities to engage
   – Identification of effective existing engagement mechanisms
   – Identification of enhanced roles needed
   – Identification of what, where and who should be involved in REDD actions
   – Coordinate and streamline engagement rules and procedures with relevant national, international donors, policies and initiatives
   – Identification of safeguards and MRV criteria
4. Strengthening engagement capacity
   - Strengthen “enabling” capacities
   - Support organization for engagement and representation of stakeholders and negotiation
   - Form appropriate REDD specific bodies
   - Build on and/or establish multi-stakeholders mechanisms at local and national level
   - Develop practical FPIC approaches
   - Pro-active measures to engage and manage private sector
   - Develop REDD national strategy appropriate to context and stakeholders
...engagement ways forward continued

5. Developing multi-stakeholder engagement
   – Resource, maintain and develop multi-stakeholder mechanisms
   – International programs adapt to findings of multi-stakeholder processes

6. Sustaining multi-stakeholder action
   – Provide financial resources
   – Sustain action on REDD pilots, policy changes and international obligations
   – Develop and implement safeguards and related MRVs
   – Implement accountability and resources mechanisms
INFORMATION - generation, quality, access and use
Challenges

• The scale of the “un-informed” is huge
• Action is needed now, yet information is incomplete
• Lack of effective communication strategies and information centers
• Systems are not sufficient to stimulate learning
• Information requirements are not currently prioritized
• Existing information needs to be mapped and dug out
... information challenges continued

• Inadequate information flow between local communities and national government
• Barriers to obtaining information
• Resources for generating and using information are lacking
• Quality of information is currently not verifiable
Ways forward on information

1. Mapping information:
   – Who produces it or maps existing information?
   – Whom is it for?
   – How is information managed?
   – What type of information?
     – Required framework for REDD+ national strategy
     – Pilots
     – Traditional knowledge
     – Feedback from international negotiations
     – How REDD activities are defined
   – Capacity and resources to deliver information?
... information ways forward continued

2. Coordinate efforts among government agencies, academia and others
3. Clear roles and responsibilities for obtaining information
4. Ensure information is adequately distributed – different levels – different stakeholders
5. Ensure international support for information dissemination
6. Information must be effectively managed
   – Multi-media information awareness program
   – National information plans
7. Creation and coordination of information centers
COST AND BENEFIT MANAGEMENT
– finance and benefit distribution mechanisms
Challenges

• Funding scale and mechanism uncertainties
  – Markets – How will they be ready? Are they reliable? What roles of private sector
  – Public funds – What scale and predictability from international community? What in-country government funding?

• REDD activity types, benefits and payments
  – Clarity on how benefit sharing will be applied to each activity
  – Do all REDD activities have to deliver “benefit sharing”?
  – Clarity on how main "drivers" of deforestation (e.g. agriculture, energy) will be compensated

Cost and benefit management
... cost & benefit management challenges cont’d

- Form of costs and benefits – implications for management
  - Distinction between benefit sharing and payments and compensation
  - Improving understanding/recognition of dependency on forests
  - Clarity on management of transaction costs
  - Value of local knowledge and experiences
  - Mechanisms and routine systems for benefits to reach local communities
... cost & benefit management challenges cont’d

- National enabling frameworks for cost and benefit management
  - Reform of national policies and legal frameworks to enable REDD costs and benefit management
  - Institutional frameworks and capacity – much to be done

- Frameworks in practice – systems, checks and balances
  - Security in practice of rights and responsibilities for costs and benefits
  - Clarity in decision making processes – quality of participation
  - Making mechanisms, national to local, actually work
  - Clarity on how payments change behavior
  - Corruption and weak enforcement checks and balances
  - Expected net implementation and transaction costs:benefits
Ways forward on cost and benefit management

• Within the forest sector
  – Use existing initiatives
  – Define policy framework to engage private sector
  – Define principles and framework
  – Calculate opportunity costs
  – Distribute benefits to entire communities, not individuals
  – Use benefits to promote SFM and certification
Outside the forest sector
  – Map how economic incentives can be used to improve local livelihoods

Linkages between the local – national – global level
  – Consultation on benefit sharing with communities
  – Reduce dependency on foreign funds, find national funds for readiness
POLICY AND LEGAL REFORM – for secure rights and responsibilities
Challenges

- Clarity of definition of rights
  - Carbon, land, tenure, customary rights
- Incorporation of safeguards and MRV in formal policy
  - Social – including FPIC
  - Environmental
- Strengthening national policy and legal framework
  - Enabling institutional mechanisms and clear roles for REDD
  - Providing consistency of sectoral policies and incentives
  - Enabling integration into broader national climate and development frameworks policy
Ways forward on policy and legal reform

• Within the forest sector:
  – Review existing legislation
  – Harnessing lessons from stakeholder involvement
  – Building on existing instruments / tools
  – Building capacity for MRV at local level
... policy and legal reform ways forward cont’d

• With other sectors beyond forest:
  – Securing rights over land at community level
  – Land tenure and forest - carbon rights
  – Mapping community forest experiences
  – Mapping and integrating sectoral policies
  – Installing landscape approaches to MRV
  – Co-benefits and safeguards and related MRV
INTEGRATION - of REDD+ into broader development and land-use
Challenges

• Diagnosis of integration challenges
  – Restraints within the forest sector are insufficient to prevent deforestation from outside the sector
  – Underlying drivers of deforestation are not well understood
  – Conflicts of interest in land distribution and land use prevail
  – Conservation is under prioritized and polices favor private enterprise
  – National governments create incentives for deforestation through economic land concessions
  – Lack of coordination between economic development and sustainability objectives
Challenges of engagement for integration

- Conflicts and synergies with other sectoral agencies vary
- Coordination mechanisms rarely strong
- Lack of ownership of planning process – plans often “top down”
- Incentives for involvement are limited
- Lack of funding for district and local planning
- Integration of sub-national initiatives, including REDD initiatives, into national planning and strategy
- Lack of coordination between organizations and programs related to forest and land use management
Integration ways forward

• Within and outside the forest sector
  – Better diagnostics, SFM efforts, certification within forest sector
  – Land use planning for livelihoods
  – Ecosystem modelling
  – Restoring degraded land, increasing agricultural productivity
  – National mapping of land use
  – Diagnostic of impact of initiatives such as the soya moratorium
  – Participatory zoning and demarcation of land use
  – Valuation as a planning tool
... integration ways forward continued

• Broader development levels
  – Build REDD into high profile national initiatives
  – Create interministerial task force and multistakeholder engagement platform
  – Promote senior level, presidential engagement
  – Incorporate REDD into national development plans
  – Strategic diagnosis of macroeconomic context
  – Mapping of existing policies relevant to REDD (including economic and social)
  – Consideration of planning and infrastructure development
  – Thematic platforms that include coordination between local, decentralized spheres and the national government.
STOP
COLLABORATE AND
LISTEN
Breakout Session Questions

• What specific examples illustrate these challenges?

• What other critical challenges are there? What specific examples?

• What specific actions are needed to tackle these challenges? What specific examples?
1. Engagement (First Floor Right Side of Stairs)
   – Facilitator: Gary Dunning
   – Rapporteur: Sarah Price
2. Policy and Legal Reform (Meeting Room)
   – Facilitator: James Mayers
   – Rapporteur: Monique Vanni
3. Information (Second Floor: Left Side near stairs)
   1. Facilitator: Joe Lawson
   2. Rapporteur: Xiaoting Hou
4. Cost and Benefit Management (Second Floor: Right Side near stairs)
   1. Facilitator: Jeannette Gurung
   2. Rapporteur: Connie Espinosa
5. Integration (Stewart’s Office)
   1. Facilitator: Stewart Maginnis
   2. Rapporteur: Jan Willem den Besten