



TPL Field Dialogue

The Forests Dialogue



Breakout Group 1 Report Back

June 15, 2023

Tree Plantations in the Landscape, Indonesia

Breakout Group 1 Report Back

Sustainable Production and Intensification

- R&D
 - Continuous improvement of material including spare varieties and continuing improvement.
 - More investment in local species for diversity and to find species for peatland restoration.
 - Costs and long time horizons of tree selection (vs. annual crops).
 - Acceptance of results by stakeholders.
- Monoculture
 - Possible benefits of native/local species
 - Potential benefits of local species for soil health
- Social security of workers
 - Child labor
 - Unpaid family labor
 - Health and safety
- Mitigating impacts of company operations on the environment
- Sustainability of planting on peat soil
 - Demands from stakeholders to move away from peat soil, developing justifications for staying on peat.
 - Further reducing emissions on peat soil.

Breakout Group 1 Report Back

Sustainable Production and Intensification

- Land use zoning
 - Issues of disturbance of communities
- FSC requirements
 - Complexity of processes for reassociation
- Genetic variability
 - Care needed when using a small number of clones to increase productivity a large area would be affected by pests, disease, wind
 - Maximum block size for dingle close planting (e.g. 100-150ha)
- Canalization
 - Impacts on access by farmers to their land in rainy season
 - There are also positive impacts for example on fishing
- Environmental management and subsequent impacts on community
 - Use of chemicals
 - Wood waste and ship traffic impacts on fishermen

Breakout Group 1 Report Back

Sustainable Production and Intensification

- Use of local species
- Consistent application of Company policy application throughout the company and into the field
 - Disconnects between policies and practices on the ground e.g. on subcontractors and child labor/family unpaid labor.
- Community awareness and understanding of regulations.
 - Relates to government regulations that are not implemented, community informed that recruitment is supposed to prioritize local people, but they are reluctant and do not realize they are prioritized.
- Economic viability
 - HTI sector is protected by the state, other land uses might replace it otherwise (but need to look at a more integrated approach)

Breakout Group 1 Report Back

Social Issues

- Inclusiveness
 - No one left behind in the communities
- Workers' rights
- Workers' health including problems not diagnosed and more comprehensive health monitoring
- Opportunities for smallholder startups, local business development, and local entrepreneurship training
- Compensation for local communities
- CSR and social jealousy
- Poverty alleviation
- Strengthening local identity
- Capacity of communities to negotiate remedy
- Measuring social impacts
- Responsibility of company vs. government



Breakout Group 2 Report Back

Tree Plantations in the Landscape, Indonesia

Breakout Group 2 Report Back

Sustainable Production and Intensification

- Soil quality, pest & disease, long term peatland viability in the future, how to anticipate its condition in the next 20-30 years.
- Human-Wildlife coexistence in and around plantations/area of operations, and accelerating recovery/reconnecting of forest fragments & preventing wildlife displacement.
- Finding the best-fit approach to adapt to climate change.
- Innovations, finding alternative sources of main commodities, esp. ones that can help HCV forest patches reconnect.
- Governance, how APRIL can contribute to more inclusive, impactful landscape approach in Riau.

Breakout Group 2 Report Back

Social Issues

- How to optimize collaboration; finding ways to bring together all stakeholders to build a common perception, understanding different governance, improving transparency, openness (no false promises).
- Identifying problems of HTI-affected communities (IP & LC) through inclusive (census, needs analysis), rights-based approaches, and formulate long term solutions, incl. potential displacement of people, access to ecosystem services, forests, livelihoods, disasters (flood, landslides), education, job security, capacity building for partnership
- Community empowerment through youth involvement and capacity.
- Trends, buyers demands, and problems will be different in the future.
- How to find best-fit approach to prioritise indigenous and local communities, through contextually/culturally sensitive approaches, incl. improving company field staff's ways in interacting with communities.



Breakout Group 3 Report Back

Tree Plantations in the Landscape, Indonesia

Breakout Group 3 Report Back

Sustainable Production and Intensification / Social Issues

- Production prone to pest and disease
- Decreasing soil fertility and peat, subsidence
- Knowledge sharing on pest and disease, mechanism for data sharing
- Increase production without extensification
- Manage supply chain for certification
- Increase smallholders supply
- Maintaining the biodiversity
- Possibility agroforestry, private companies focus on monoculture
- Reduce the number chemical fertilizer
- Land suitability cause problems for the communities.
- Business benefit is long investment, capital and ROI.
- How to balance to sustainable production/ intensification and impact to the social and environment.
- Where carbon issue and peatland conservation/ restoration should take into account in sustainable production and intensification?
- Tree plantations spatial planning need to be focused and how to optimize conservation area within tree plantation for environmental services

Breakout Group 3 Report Back

Sustainable Production and Intensification / Social Issues

- How justice mechanism is in place, gap analysis on justice
- How to develop common perception on regulation and practices.
- Increasing production need to interlink to recognition of indigenous, culture, identity, NRM
- Workers are still subcontracted, no trade unions, no welfare security especially local workers who might have stake to the lands
- Ignorance of private companies about the existence of customary people as the province already map the customary boundaries
- Access to education for communities. How private sectors should help this?
- Three main challenges: (i) social impact, (ii) directly/ indirectly; governance/ regulation/ mechanism; other entities in the landscape face same impact and challenges, how these entities working together.



Breakout Group 4 Report Back

Tree Plantations in the Landscape, Indonesia

Breakout Group 1 Report Back

Sustainable Production and Intensification

1. Mechanization is also intensification and also related to the social aspects; how it's impacts on social aspects, in particular on labour retrenchment?
 - Significant safety benefit of operations
 - Challenges is finding sub-contractor (skilled labour), many of local communities do not want to do the labour of planting, fertilizer, maintaining, and harvesting.
 - Need to invest on human resources training to become a machine operator.
 - Forest labour jobs is not seen as high-level jobs in the society.
2. Government Regulation Perpres 71/2014 jo. 57/2016 about peatland management (no planting with water table more than 40 cm under peatland surface – not based on scientific research).
 - All plantations developed on protection forests until the licence expired, after that restoration must be done.
 - Half of APRIL's plantation on the peatland; licence will expire in 2033.
3. Lack of research on intensification/silviculture technique and knowledge sharing between concessions.
4. How to increase the capacity building of communities' partners in intensification.
5. Land use competition with other sectors.

Breakout Group 4 Report Back

Social Issues

- a. Lack of clarity of land tenure and legal certainty.
- b. Filtered (not really valid) information about social problems from the ground.
- c. Local communities do not interest on HTI/HTR because economic benefits are less than palm oil.
- d. Customary people do not know the economic benefits of acacia; limited: lack of knowledge and capital on how to plant acacia.
- e. Impacts from palm oil and tree plantations: flooding.
- f. Lack of communication (trust) between companies (HTI, palm oil, and mining) and local communities.
- g. Lack of identification the communities' need in relation with Corporate Social Responsibility; not focusing on money, but also on capacity building and other skills.
- h. Lack of the Government's roles in disputing social conflict.
- i. Changes in social economy of local communities who starting interest to work on the plantations.
- j. Need to think a long-term of what kind of plantations that benefit to change paradigm away from palm oil.



Restoration Scoping Dialogue

The Forests Dialogue



Environmental Challenges: Breakout Group 1 Report Back

Tree Plantations in the Landscape, Indonesia

Breakout Group 1 Report Back

Peatland, Climate, Biodiversity Conservation & Restoration

- Seriousness of stakeholders on legal compliance & enforcement – regulations are comprehensive
- Involving communities effectively and fairly in peatland management
- Climate change introducing additional variability in seasons, rainfall, phenology etc
- Assessing phenology of native peatland tree species (and links to faunal ecology)
- Communication between stakeholders including in landscape scale approaches
- Wildlife human conflict and poaching
- Reintroduction of native species
- Management of canalization, including with climate change
- Integrated production and protection approach – various ongoing challenges

Breakout Group 1 Report Back

Peatland, Climate, Biodiversity Conservation & Restoration

- Innovation and technology, for example in water level management
- Enhancing structural and functional connectivity of patches of native forest
- Underpinning much of the above: deepening understanding of peatland ecology, biodiversity composition and function, ecosystem services – complex, costly, long-term studies
- Restoration of degraded peatlands, depending on functional connectivity (seed dispersal) and opportunity for restoration and reducing emissions with communities on large areas of degraded peatland (governance, carbon market, ecological understanding, and other challenges)
- Need to study propagation and establishment with native peatland species
- Building local community support restoration and ensuring its value to the economy



Environmental Challenges: Breakout Group 2 Report Back

Tree Plantations in the Landscape, Indonesia

Breakout Group 2 Report Back

Peatland, Climate, Biodiversity Conservation & Restoration

- Updating baselines of damaged and intact peatlands, and who are the actors and the affected in the landscape.
- How to send the main message: that Indonesia should take good care of peatlands, especially because peatlands are planetary issues. Developed countries continue to catalyze peatland degradation while pressuring poor countries.
- Gaining more knowledge on peatland science (emissions, plantation on peatlands impacts, other peatland-climate issues).
- Finding best-fit models of community-based sustainable peatland-based livelihoods. Many livelihood and empowerment interventions are pilots, with no concrete evidence of impacts on peatland recovery or climate resilience (apart from fire prevention).
- Knowledge regarding mitigation of impacts regarding peatland production.

Breakout Group 2 Report Back

Peatland, Climate, Biodiversity Conservation & Restoration

- APRIL manages approx. 1% of Indonesia's peatlands, palm oil industries manage more peatlands, resulting in more damaged peatlands and carbon emissions, they pose risks to not only APRIL sustainable operations but also communities and environment if not managed carefully.
- HTI (requires license from government's forestry authority), while palm oil (does not require license).
- Integrated peatland management, this is mainly due to poor regulation, void of responsible/accountable governance and implementation on peatland management.
- Finding best-fit models of community-based sustainable peatland-based livelihoods. How peatland communities can have the same level of standards on capabilities.
- How to amplify local wisdom of indigenous people through empowerment/approaches that respect their local wisdom (e.g. reading the forest and ecosystem health through listening to voices of forest animals).

Breakout Group 2 Report Back

Peatland, Climate, Biodiversity Conservation & Restoration

- Biodiversity baselining takes too long and too costly.
- How to help wildlife populations to recover to viable level (incl. Supporting population increase, habitat carrying capacity & maximum possible populations, habitat recovery, coexistence).
- How to build a landscape-wide partnership for managing the spatially overlapping land use by human beings and wildlife (incl. SOPs for safe human-wildlife encounters/coexistence, alleviating poaching of key species in peat forests and concession areas while ensuring that source of food (meat-based proteins) for communities is available).
- How to ensure foresters and forestry business planners and managers have biodiversity conservation in their list of priorities (at least to protect what remains and restore what's degraded). Foresters do not have the same mentality with ecologists since they are usually not trained in biodiversity conservation.



Environmental Challenges: Breakout Group 3 Report Back

Tree Plantations in the Landscape, Indonesia

Breakout Group 3 Report Back

Peatland, Climate, Biodiversity Conservation & Restoration

- · Government strategic plan and priorities. How they align with peatland management/ climate change where somehow the government priorities to use peat for food estate, or how we can change the policies unmanaged peatland to managed peatland?
- · Maintaining watertable in peat. How we can have water management in peatland?
- · Lack of innovation technology for hydrological that cost effective that adopt by communities
- · Reward and punishment to stakeholders who manage peat
- · Peat is borderless, how cooperation among different stakeholders and address the externalities
- · What is the net sink emission from the peat?
- · Peat is no value, we need to change what is the value? Carbon?
- · Government promote and priorities on food estate. What are the priorities?
- · Recognition of the LC to the peat area
- · Are there any invasive species in the peatland?
- · Local traditional
- · How the company get benefits when peat is conserved while they have to make a business

Breakout Group 3 Report Back

Peatland, Climate, Biodiversity Conservation & Restoration

- · Biodiversity conservation and restoration
- · HCV, where will be targeted for the next restoration? Threaten to communities land?
- · Reframe what is the degradation and restoration
- · How to evaluate biodiversity? No measurement and evaluation. Good indicators to monitor
- · Conservation area dispersed and need to be connected. How we do it? Conservation network and no landscape agreement among the land managers and government.
- · Conservation need link to carbon trade. Uncertain regulation and mechanism
- · Nature and culture need to be balanced
- · Community based conservation, what is the healthy communities? Need to think and interlink between communities and conservation
- · Lack of data and sharing data how the decision takes especially where corridor and how to replicate BMP
- · What are the incentives for communities willingly to restore the landscape beside carbon trade?
- · Source income sustain for communities
- · NTFP needs to be optimized. Incentive such as certification for smallholders is very hard. Need government intervention especially for biodiversity protection.



Environmental Challenges: Breakout Group 4 Report Back

Tree Plantations in the Landscape, Indonesia

Breakout Group 4 Report Back

Peatland Management and Climate

- Lack of investment in local science on peat and GHG emissions; mostly science from developed countries.
- Lack of control and efforts to reduce deforestation and fire prevention/suppression.
- Integrated peatland management (not only at the concession level).
- Implementing canal blocking and no new canal.
- No clear regulations on carbon trading and strategy to achieve net zero emissions/commitment in Indonesia.
- Lack of community participation to protect and manage the peatland.
- Lack of knowledge on peatland as ecosystem.
- Lack of understanding on climate change; only at the top level but not at the ground level (young and family).
- Lack of diversity of the planting at the edges for the improvement of water regulation and wind break.
- Lack of long-term incentive for sustainable peatland management.
- Lack of climate change mitigation and adaptation at the stakeholders and communities level.

Breakout Group 4 Report Back

Biodiversity Conservation & Restoration

- Lack of research and knowledge on biodiversity valuation and monetization
- Typically focus on mega-fauna (incomprehensive wildlife management)
- Carrying capacity of habitat has not been considered
- Habitat understanding
- Human-wildlife conflict
- Illegal poaching and wildlife trading
- Lack of corridor connectivity at the landscape
- Lack of stakeholders' data sharing on biodiversity
- No regulation requires palm oil plantations to engage more in biodiversity conservation and restoration
- Lack of restoration design - contextual based approach
- Lack of reference ecosystem in the context of restoration